

## Online Appendix

“Clubs of Autocrats: Regional Organizations and Authoritarian Survival”

Maria Josepha Debre

*The Review of International Organizations*

### Robustness Checks – Replicating Table 1

Table A1: Replicating Table 1 with Regional Diffusion .....	2
Table A2: Replicating Table 1 with Time since last Event .....	3
Table A3: Replicating Table 1 without Stratification (Time since last Event).....	4
Table A4: Replicating Table 1 with Region Fixed Effects.....	5
Table A5: Replicating Table 1 with Overlap.....	7
Table A6: Replicating Table 1 with Average Density.....	8
Table A7: Replicating Table 1 with V-Dem Data .....	9
Table A8: Replicating Table 1 with Aggregate Gdp Per Capita .....	10

### Additional Material

Table A9: Proportional Hazard Assumption Democratization.....	11
Table A10: Proportional Hazard Assumption Autocratic Replacements .....	11
Table A11: List of Regional Organizations .....	12

Table A1: Replicating Table 1 with Regional Diffusion

	Democratization	Autocratic Replacements
	(1)	(2)
Autocratic Density	<b>-0.0554*</b> (0.0281)	0.00962 (0.0254)
Diffusion Regional	-0.00719 (0.00640)	0.00479 (0.00952)
Authority	0.210 (0.482)	-0.106 (0.704)
Hegemon	0.534 (0.319)	-0.135 (0.278)
Cold War	0.577 (0.383)	-0.747 (0.484)
Contagion		
Previous Democratization <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>	-0.471 (0.539)	
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>		<b>-1.052*</b> (0.445)
Regime Type		
Military	<b>2.112***</b> (0.328)	0.215 (0.335)
Monarchy	<b>-33.22***</b> (0.514)	0.407 (0.496)
Personal	0.629 (0.393)	<b>0.739*</b> (0.333)
Growth	<b>-4.314**</b> (1.418)	<b>-6.621***</b> (1.546)
Resources	-0.0445 (0.0532)	<b>-0.107*</b> (0.0424)
<i>N</i>	3149	3149

Stratified Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.

\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

Table A2: Replicating Table 1 with Time since last Event

	Democratization	Autocratic Replacements
	(1)	(2)
Autocratic Density	<b>-0.0699*</b> (0.0333)	0.0327 (0.0243)
Authority	0.0405 (0.425)	0.000998 (0.507)
Hegemon	0.671 (0.407)	0.170 (0.398)
Cold War	<b>0.733*</b> (0.322)	<b>-1.521***</b> (0.446)
Contagion		
Previous Democratization <sub>t-1</sub>	-0.793 (0.584)	
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub>t-1</sub>		-0.924 (0.519)
Regime Type		
Military	<b>2.605***</b> (0.412)	<b>1.134*</b> (0.447)
Monarchy	-0.641 (1.068)	-0.301 (0.546)
Personal	<b>1.205***</b> (0.437)	<b>1.191**</b> (0.372)
Growth	<b>-3.145***</b> (0.911)	<b>-4.916***</b> (1.082)
Resources	0.0488 (0.0718)	<b>-0.104*</b> (0.0441)
<i>N</i>	3149	3149

Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.  
 \*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

Table A3: Replicating Table 1 without Stratification (Time since last Event)

	Democratization	Autocratic Replacements
	(1)	(2)
Autocratic Density	<b>-0.0591*</b> (0.0261)	0.00148 (0.0209)
Authority	0.0694 (0.472)	0.110 (0.500)
Hegemon	0.524 (0.294)	0.250 (0.324)
Cold War	<b>0.872**</b> (0.298)	<b>-0.768*</b> (0.360)
Contagion		
Previous Democratization <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>	-0.595 (0.409)	
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>		<b>-1.002*</b> (0.452)
Regime Type		
Military	<b>2.736***</b> (0.374)	0.427 (0.338)
Monarchy	-0.841 (1.171)	0.455 (0.476)
Personal	<b>1.202***</b> (0.361)	<b>0.791**</b> (0.295)
Growth	<b>-3.493***</b> (0.992)	<b>-4.624***</b> (1.177)
Resources	-0.0279 (0.0442)	<b>-0.0786*</b> (0.0364)
<i>N</i>	3149	3149

Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.  
 \*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

Table A4: Replicating Table 1 with Region Fixed Effects

	Democratization						Autocratic Replacements					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Autocratic Density	<b>-0.0673**</b> (0.0251)	<b>-0.0671**</b> (0.0256)	<b>-0.0639*</b> (0.0307)	<b>-0.0721*</b> (0.0294)	<b>-0.0606*</b> (0.0269)	<b>-0.0884**</b> (0.0292)	0.0166 (0.0242)	0.0224 (0.0265)	0.0151 (0.0211)	0.0334 (0.0270)	0.00730 (0.0243)	0.00691 (0.0318)
Authority	0.180 (0.469)	0.156 (0.462)	0.107 (0.488)	0.0908 (0.506)	0.152 (0.463)	0.00801 (0.457)	-0.0500 (0.706)	0.0195 (0.715)	-0.0668 (0.717)	0.197 (0.730)	-0.0659 (0.701)	-0.110 (0.707)
Hegemon	0.549 (0.322)	0.542 (0.356)	0.544 (0.350)	0.600 (0.333)	0.621 (0.327)	0.491 (0.343)	-0.206 (0.262)	-0.191 (0.299)	-0.151 (0.269)	0.0160 (0.293)	-0.149 (0.284)	-0.206 (0.278)
Cold War	0.641 (0.381)	0.712 (0.380)	0.665 (0.362)	0.669 (0.371)	0.730 (0.374)	0.711 (0.377)	-0.830 (0.454)	-0.653 (0.536)	-0.777 (0.475)	-0.638 (0.481)	-0.823 (0.499)	-0.793 (0.495)
Contagion Previous Democratization <sub>t-1</sub>	-0.530 (0.548)	-0.475 (0.537)	-0.373 (0.441)	-0.456 (0.564)	-0.475 (0.543)	-0.457 (0.537)						
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub>t-1</sub>							<b>-1.322*</b> (0.631)	<b>-0.875*</b> (0.417)	<b>-1.035*</b> (0.425)	<b>-1.242**</b> (0.435)	<b>-1.091*</b> (0.441)	<b>-1.028*</b> (0.430)
Regime Type												
Military	<b>2.255***</b> (0.343)	<b>2.121***</b> (0.340)	<b>2.180***</b> (0.323)	<b>2.196***</b> (0.325)	<b>2.148***</b> (0.316)	<b>2.193***</b> (0.307)	0.194 (0.331)	-0.0107 (0.351)	0.198 (0.332)	0.0919 (0.335)	0.263 (0.332)	0.172 (0.328)
Monarchy	<b>-33.12***</b> (0.518)	<b>-34.32***</b> (0.539)	<b>-35.02***</b> (1.905)	-36.15 (.)	<b>-32.15***</b> (0.515)	<b>-33.12***</b> (0.512)	0.450 (0.501)	0.577 (0.514)	0.388 (0.562)	0.285 (0.526)	0.384 (0.483)	0.423 (0.499)
Personal	0.736* (0.365)	0.717 (0.367)	0.719 (0.368)	0.731* (0.369)	0.599 (0.404)	0.662 (0.363)	<b>0.702*</b> (0.323)	<b>0.620</b> (0.333)	<b>0.708*</b> (0.327)	<b>0.680*</b> (0.329)	<b>0.829*</b> (0.327)	<b>0.682*</b> (0.325)
Growth	<b>-4.292**</b> (1.346)	<b>-4.195**</b> (1.425)	<b>-4.305**</b> (1.415)	<b>-4.206**</b> (1.389)	<b>-4.371**</b> (1.474)	<b>-3.923**</b> (1.307)	<b>-6.699***</b> (1.555)	<b>-6.706***</b> (1.549)	<b>-6.639***</b> (1.547)	<b>-6.847***</b> (1.512)	<b>-6.427***</b> (1.531)	<b>-6.621***</b> (1.547)
Resources	-0.0488 (0.0558)	-0.0427 (0.0532)	-0.0329 (0.0580)	-0.0345 (0.0537)	-0.0425 (0.0522)	-0.0468 (0.0525)	<b>-0.111*</b> (0.0434)	<b>-0.118*</b> (0.0379)	<b>-0.109*</b> (0.0435)	<b>-0.132***</b> (0.0395)	<b>-0.105*</b> (0.0418)	<b>-0.110**</b> (0.0408)

Region												
Eurasia	0.408 (0.390)					0.564 (0.795)						
Latin America & Caribbean	0.198 (0.360)					<b>0.810*</b> (0.409)						
MENA			-0.466 (1.724)					0.0603 (0.579)				
Sub-Saharan Africa				0.111 (0.363)					-0.664 (0.368)			
Europe & North America					0.800 (0.468)						-45.02 (.)	
Asia						-0.738 (0.385)						-0.282 (0.445)
<i>N</i>	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149	3149

Stratified Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported. \*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

Table A5: Replicating Table 1 with Overlap

	Democratization		Autocratic Replacements	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Autocratic Density		<b>-0.0554*</b> (0.0260)		0.0119 (0.0291)
Overlap	-0.218 (0.115)	-0.119 (0.119)	0.0593 (0.0892)	0.0349 (0.108)
Authority	0.120 (0.453)	0.165 (0.456)	-0.0596 (0.711)	-0.0627 (0.713)
Hegemon	0.365 (0.268)	0.601 (0.311)	-0.113 (0.237)	-0.171 (0.281)
Cold War	0.699 (0.386)	0.767 (0.393)	-0.806 (0.495)	-0.815 (0.497)
Contagion				
Previous Democratization <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>	-0.589 (0.550)	-0.494 (0.540)		
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>			<b>-1.042*</b> (0.421)	<b>-1.027*</b> (0.428)
Regime Type				
Military	<b>2.176***</b> (0.297)	<b>2.219***</b> (0.316)	0.171 (0.333)	0.193 (0.330)
Monarchy	<b>-33.30***</b> (0.548)	<b>-32.29***</b> (0.516)	0.451 (0.472)	0.411 (0.493)
Personal	0.667 (0.365)	0.764* (0.364)	<b>0.708*</b> (0.323)	<b>0.705*</b> (0.324)
Growth	<b>-4.314**</b> (1.583)	<b>-4.380**</b> (1.441)	<b>-6.723***</b> (1.531)	<b>-6.670***</b> (1.547)
Resources	-0.0586 (0.0533)	-0.0466 (0.0540)	<b>-0.104*</b> (0.0433)	<b>-0.107*</b> (0.0424)
<i>N</i>	3149	3149	3149	3149

Stratified Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.

\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

Table A6: Replicating Table 1 with Average Density

	Democratization	Autocratic Replacements
	(1)	(2)
Average Density	<b>-0.131**</b> (0.0444)	-0.0699 (0.0490)
Authority	0.0235 (0.453)	-0.130 (0.709)
Hegemon	0.489 (0.296)	0.125 (0.265)
Cold War	0.390 (0.365)	-0.752 (0.468)
Contagion		
Previous Democratization <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>	-0.417 (0.536)	
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>		<b>-1.091**</b> (0.420)
Regime Type		
Military	<b>1.935***</b> (0.324)	0.0278 (0.330)
Monarchy	<b>-33.06***</b> (0.475)	0.632 (0.460)
Personal	0.627 (0.368)	<b>0.706*</b> (0.327)
Growth	<b>-4.464***</b> (1.351)	<b>-6.888***</b> (1.523)
Resources	-0.0470 (0.0508)	<b>-0.0939*</b> (0.0429)
<i>N</i>	3149	3149

Stratified Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.

\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$



Table A7: Replicating Table 1 with V-Dem Data

	Democratization	Autocratic Replacements
	(1)	(2)
Average Density	<b>2.874</b> <sup>*1</sup> (1.416)	3.096 (2.185)
Authority	0.217 (0.449)	-0.0213 (0.701)
Membership <sup>2</sup>	<b>-1.509</b> <sup>*</sup> (0.712)	-0.112 (0.877)
Hegemon	0.428 (0.338)	-0.273 (0.255)
Cold War	0.318 (0.394)	<b>-1.233</b> <sup>**</sup> (0.461)
Contagion		
Previous Democratization <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>	-0.667 (0.611)	
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>		<b>-1.027</b> <sup>*</sup> (0.448)
Regime Type		
Military	<b>2.071</b> <sup>***</sup> (0.326)	0.0900 (0.333)
Monarchy	<b>-33.19</b> <sup>***</sup> (0.531)	0.527 (0.500)
Personal	0.600 (0.369)	<b>0.695</b> <sup>*</sup> (0.337)
Growth	<b>-4.534</b> <sup>**</sup> (1.387)	<b>-6.702</b> <sup>***</sup> (1.542)
Resources	-0.0389 (0.0517)	-0.115 <sup>**</sup> (0.0415)
<i>N</i>	3126	3126

Stratified Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.

\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

<sup>1</sup> In this scale of Autocratic density based on the V-Dem data, higher values refer to higher democracy scores. Thus, the hazard of democratization increases with higher democratic density values.

<sup>2</sup> Due to the coding of V-Dem data on a normalized scale from 0-1, I add an additional dummy variable controlling for autocratic RO membership. The hazard of democratization decreases with autocratic RO membership.

Table A8: Replicating Table 1 with Aggregate Gdp Per Capita

	Democratization	Autocratic Replacements
	(1)	(2)
Average Density	<b>-0.0977*</b> (0.0444)	-0.0698 (0.0509)
Authority	0.139 (0.545)	-0.389 (0.824)
Aggregate gdp (log)	0.185 (0.265)	-0.126 (0.246)
Hegemon	0.566 (0.368)	-0.238 (0.322)
Cold War	0.383 (0.494)	-0.825 (0.490)
Contagion		
Previous Democratization <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>	-1.114 (0.710)	
Previous Autocratic Replacement <sub><i>t-1</i></sub>		-0.594 (0.399)
Regime Type		
Military	<b>2.046***</b> (0.351)	-0.192 (0.383)
Monarchy	<b>-31.18***</b> (0.623)	0.412 (0.534)
Personal	0.412 (0.449)	0.567 (0.350)
Growth	<b>-4.713**</b> (1.776)	<b>-6.948***</b> (1.611)
Resources	-0.0474 (0.0589)	<b>-0.0994*</b> (0.0465)
<i>N</i>	2527	2527

Stratified Cox proportional hazard models with robust standard errors in parentheses and coefficients reported.  
 \*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*  $p < 0.01$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.001$

Table A9: Proportional Hazard Assumption Democratization

rho		chi2	df	Prob>chi2
Autocratic Density	-0.01136	0.02	1	0.8788
Authority	0.09474	0.97	1	0.3248
Hegemon	0.06213	0.47	1	0.4942
Contagion_dem	-0.05283	0.29	1	0.5929
Contagion_aut	0.14066	2.67	1	0.1020
Regime Type Military	-0.09683	1.23	1	0.2682
Regime Type Monarchy	-0.02718	0.40	1	0.5275
Regime Type Party (omitted category)	.	.	1	.
Regime Type Personal	-0.15634	3.05	1	0.0805
Growth	-0.03899	0.11	1	0.7404
Resources	-0.12779	1.37	1	0.2419
Global Test		7.27	10	0.6999

Table A10: Proportional Hazard Assumption Autocratic Replacements

rho		chi2	df	Prob>chi2
Autocratic Density	0.15245	2.06	1	0.1516
Authority	0.15782	2.46	1	0.1169
Hegemon	-0.16945	2.80	1	0.0943
Contagion_dem	-0.21373	6.76	1	0.0093
Contagion_aut	0.03876	0.10	1	0.7522
Regime Type Military	0.01810	0.02	1	0.8964
Regime Type Monarchy	0.01583	0.02	1	0.8880
Regime Type Party (omitted category)		.	1	.
Regime Type Personal	-0.04387	0.17	1	0.6843
Growth	0.06950	0.35	1	0.5550
Resources	0.08776	0.43	1	0.5110
Global Test		8.63	10	0.5674

Table A11: List of Regional Organizations<sup>3</sup>

Name	Acronym	Founded (Died)	Autocratic Density <sup>4</sup>
African and Malagasy Union (succeeded by OCAM)	AMU/UAMCE	1961 (1965)	-5,406
African Union	AU	2001	1,193
Andean Community	Andean	1996	7,021
Arab Cooperation Council	ACC	1989 (1990)	-6,000
Arab Maghreb Union	AMU	1989	-4,836
Arctic Council	Arctic	1996	9,238
Asia -Pacific Economic Cooperation	APEC	1989	5,331
Asian and Pacific Council	ASPAC	1966 (1973)	2,389
Association of Caribbean States	ACS	1994	n.A. <sup>5</sup>
Association of South East Asian Nations	ASEAN	1967	-1,659
Association of South-East Asia (succeeded by ASEAN)	ASA	1961 (1967)	2,667
Bay of Bengal Initiative for Multi-Sectoral Technical and Economic Cooperation	BIMSTEC	1997	3,167
Benelux Union	Benelux	1958	9,950
Bolivarian Alliance for the Peoples of Our America	ALBA	2004	4,100
Caribbean Community	CARICOM	1973	2,111
Central Africa Economic and Monetary Community	CEMAC	1994	-2,035
Central African Customs and Economic Union (succeeded by CEMAC)	UDEAC	1964 (1998)	-6,073
Central American Integration System	SICA	1991	7,786
Central Asian Cooperation Organization (2000) (formerly Central Asian Commonwealth (1991), Central Asian Economic Union (1994) & Central Asian Economic Cooperation (1998)) (merged with EurAsEC)	CAC/ CAEU/CAEC	1991 (2005)	-3,665
Central Treaty Organization	CENTO	1955 (1979)	0,384
Collective Security Treaty Organization	CSTO	2002	-1,952
Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa	COMESA	1994	0,187
Commonwealth of Independent States	CIS	1991	-1,431
Commonwealth of Independent States Collective Security Treaty (succeeded by CSTO)	CST	1992 (2002)	-2,639
Community of Sahel-Saharan States	CEN-SAD	1998	0,633
Council of Arab Economic Unity	CAEU	1957	-6,346
Council of Europe	CE	1949	8,166
Council of the Baltic Sea States	CBSS	1992	8,953
East African Community	EAC	2000	1,009
Economic Community of Central African States	ECCAS	1981	-3,132
Economic Community of the Great Lakes Countries	CEPGL	1976	-3,714
Economic Community of West African States	ECOWAS	1975	-2,006

<sup>3</sup> Data on membership and accession dates based on Correlates of War IGO v3 Dataset.

<sup>4</sup> Density values (polity) averaged over RO lifecycle, -10 – 5 signify autocratic, 6-10 democratic.

<sup>5</sup> Majority of member states not covered by polity due to size.

Economic Cooperation Organization	ECO	1985	-2,883
Entente Council	Entente	1959	-3,817
Eurasian Economic Community	EurAseC/ EAEC	2000	-3,152
European Coal and Steel Community	ECSC	1952 (2002)	9,654
European Community (succeeded by EU)	EEC	1958 (1992)	9,702
European Union	EU	1993	9,714
GUAM Organization for Democracy and Economic Development	GUAM	2001	3,500
Gulf Cooperation Council	GCC	1981	-8,672
Gulf of Guinea Commission	GGC	1999	-1,125
Indian Ocean Commission	IOC	1982	7,184
Intergovernmental Authority on Development	IGAD	1986	-3,099
Latin American and the Caribbean Economic System	SELA	1975	3,861
Latin American Integration Association	LAIA	1980	4,836
League of Arab States	LAS	1945	-5,929
Mano River Union	MRU	1973	-2,709
Mekong-Ganga Cooperation Scheme	MGC	2000	-0,773
Nordic Council	NC	1952	10,000
North Atlantic Treaty Organization	NATO	1949	9,148
Organisation of Eastern Caribbean States	OECS	1981	n.A. <sup>5</sup>
Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe	OSCE	1975	5,717
Organization of African Unity (succeeded by AU)	OAU	1963 (2002)	-3,553
Organization of American States	OAS	1948	2,527
Organization of Black Sea Economic Cooperation	BSEC	1992	5,758
Organization of Central American States (succeeded by SICA)	ODECA/ OCAS	1951 (1973)	-0,448
Pacific Island Forum	PIF	1971	10,000
Shanghai Cooperation Organization	SCO	2001	-3,100
South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation	SAARC	1985	4,054
Southeast Asia Treaty Organization	SEATO	1954 (1977)	5,545
Southern African Customs Union	SACU	1969	1,938
Southern African Development Community	SADC	1992	3,154
Southern African Development Coordination Conference (succeeded by SADC)	SADCC	1980 (1992)	-3,761
Southern Common Market	MERCOSUR	1991	8,183
Union for the Mediterranean	UfM	1995	7,174
Union of South American Nations	UNASUR	2004	7,600
Warsaw Treaty Organization (succeeded by CIS)	WTO	1955 (1991)	-6,892
West Africa Economic and Monetary Union	UEMOA	1994	1,767
West African Economic Community (succeeded by UEMOA)	CEAO	1973 (1994)	-5,137